

**REPORT OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSION
FOLLOWING THE ASSESSMENT OF COMPLIANCE WITH
THE STANDARDS FOR PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION
OF THE BACHELOR'S DEGREE PROGRAMME IN PHARMACY
OF THE KAZAKH MEDICAL UNIVERSITY OF CONTINUING
EDUCATION**

1. Composition of the commission

According to the ECAQA Order No. 18 dated January 21, 2019, an External Expert Commission (EEC) was formed to conduct 6-7 February 2019 the accreditation of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" of Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education JSC with the following membership:



Chairperson -

Eralieva Lyazzat Tasbulatovna,

Doctor of Medicine, Professor,
Deputy Director of the National Scientific Center of
Phthisiopulmonology of the Ministry of Health of
the Republic of Kazakhstan, Corresponding Member
of the Russian Academy of Natural History (RANH)
in the section "Medical Sciences", Member of the
European Society of Clinical Microbiology and
Infectious Diseases



International expert -

Grigoryan Artem Sergeevich,

Candidate of Medicine, Assistant Professor of the
Department of Pathophysiology, Head of the
Department of Quality Assurance of Education of
Yerevan State Medical University named after
Mkhitar Heratsi, Member of the Armenian
Association of Biochemists,
Member of the Armenian Medical Association



National expert -

Salimgereeva Bagdat Zhanabaevna,

Doctor of Medicine, Professor,
Head of the Department of Anatomy with a course
of histology and physiology
of the NSEI "Kazakh-Russian Medical University"



National expert -

Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna,

Candidate of Medicine, Assistant Professor of the Department of Public Health of West Kazakhstan Medical University named after Marat Ospanov



National expert -

Myrzagulova Asel Oryntaevna,

Candidate of Medicine, Head of clinical research centre Kazakhstan's Medical University "KSPH"



National expert -

Zhakypbekov Kayrat Saparkhanovich,

PhD, Assistant Professor, Head of the Department of Organization, Management and Economics of Pharmacy and Clinical Pharmacy, National Medical University JSC



National expert -

Aldabergenova Taurzhan Kalibekovna,

Candidate of Medicine, Assistant Professor of the Department of Orthopedic and paediatric dentistry Astana Medical University JSC



**Expert – Representative
of practical healthcare –
Aytzhanova Ayzhan Adilovna,**
Ultrasonographer of Radiodiagnosis Department
Center of Pediatric Emergency First Aid in Almaty



**Expert-student -
Dzhangarasheva Dariya Erzhanovna**
Second-year student of
Department of General Medicine
NSEI “Kazakh-Russian Medical University”



**Expert-student -
Doschanova Roza Serikovna,**
Fifth-year student of Department “Dentistry”
National Medical University JSC



**ECAQA observer-
Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna**
Doctor of Medicine, Professor, MBA
Eurasian Center for Accreditation and Quality
Assurance in Higher Education and Health Care,
Director General

The assessment of the compliance of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" of KazMUCE with the ECAQA's Standards for Programme Accreditation was carried out from 06.02 till 07.02 2019.

The EEC report contains an assessment of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" for compliance with the ECAQA's Standards for Programme Accreditation, and the EEC recommendations on further improvement of the educational programme implementation.

2. General part of the EEC final report

Joint-stock company "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education" has a State license No.KZ52LAA00006249, issued on December 3, 2015 to participate in educational activities. KazMUCE received an Attachment to the license for the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy".

The mission of KazMUCE: To ensure the implementation of the policy of training of competitive professional and academic staff, based on the principles of continuous development and the triunity of science, practice and education. **The goal** is to prepare professional and academic staff in accordance with the principles of the Bologna process through the provision of quality continuous education.

Strategic orientations:

1. To strengthen strategic management, to improve the efficiency of the management system.
2. To enlarge the staff training area (multitasking and a full cycle of staff training).
3. To ensure the quality of KazMUCE educational programmes and to bring them to conformity with international standards.
4. To develop human resources.
5. To form a successful learner.
6. To develop research activities.
7. To improve clinical activities.
8. To develop infrastructure based on the formation of a sustainable financial model.

Long-term vision: KazMUCE is a leader in the field of staff training, providing high-quality and modern education for professionals of a new breed who are capable of practical implementation of the knowledge gained.

The mission of the educational programme in "Pharmacy" (Bachelor's degree) is to continuously and comprehensively train highly qualified personnel for the dynamically developing sector of the national economy - pharmacy, effectively implementing innovations in education, science and practice to meet the needs of the individual, society and the state.

On October 22, 2018, ECAQA organized a Pre-site visit of an expert commission consisting of: Chair Sarsenbayeva Saule, ECAQA Director General, expert on accreditation of basic, postgraduate and continuous medical education of ECAQA, members: Nurmanbetova Farida, ECAQA science advisor, WFME top advisor; Ramazanova Sholpan, Head of the Department of Children's Diseases No.

3 of NMU JSC, an expert in accreditation of basic, postgraduate and continuous medical education of ECAQA; Zhumagaliyev Aday, student of KRMU, KAZMSA local director.

Recommendations on the entire process of self-assessment of the Bachelor's degree educational programmes were made during the preliminary visit

The accreditation of the Bachelor's degree educational programme in Pharmacy" has not been carried out until the present because of obtaining a state license in 2018.

3. Analysis of the report on the self-assessment of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" for compliance with the ECAQA's Standards for Programme Accreditation

The report on the self-assessment of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" is presented on 107 pages, excluding applications. It is characterized by the completeness, structuredness and internal unity of information provided by KazMUCE on this educational programme. The report is gone with a cover letter signed by the vice rector for academic activities, a member of the KazMUCE JSC board, professor Doskozhaeva Saule, confirming the adequacy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report was drawn up in accordance with the Self-Evaluation Manual for Specialized Accreditation and fully complies with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards for the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy".

The self-assessment of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" was carried out on the basis of the order No. 80 - OD dated 10.09.2018 "On approval of the working group participants to prepare for the accreditation of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy".

4. The level and quality of self-assessment of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy"

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report, experts found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the accreditation standard for the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" of medical education organizations (HEI).

The report is written skillfully, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and have continuous numbering. There are references to normative legal acts, model rules and documents of KazMUCE.

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the ECAQA educational programs accreditation standards criteria and the answers to the questions formulated in the Self-Evaluation Manual were got.

All the standards of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" indicate a real practice, facts and examples confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Following the accreditation standards the description of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" is complete, updated (according to

the number of students, data on acceptance, the results of intermediate control, monitoring based on feedback, financial information, etc.).

The conclusion on each of the accreditation standards of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement. In accordance with the requirements of the ECAQA Self-Evaluation Manual, copies of documents which supplement the description of the accreditation standards are attached to the report.

So, the Self-Assessment Report of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" contains reliable, detailed, structured information on all activities in accordance with the ECAQA specialized accreditation standards.

5. Analysis for compliance with the specialized accreditation standards based on the results of an external evaluation of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" and a review of the each standard strong points

Standard 1: Mission and outcomes

KazMUCE has developed and informed relevant stakeholders about the university's and the educational programme's missions, with that the administrative and managerial staff, a number of teachers and student active group were involved in formulating the mission. As an education organization with a private form of ownership (sole founder).

The university has autonomy while developing strategies, planning various types of activities (education, science, clinic), at the same time sticking to the goals and objectives of government programmatic documents and orders of departmental institutions (MES RK, MH RK). The goals of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" are aimed at achieving the outcomes directly related to the mission.

Strong points:

- Participation of students and stakeholders in the definition of the mission of this educational programme
- Introduction into the educational process of innovative teaching methods
- Feedback

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 11, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 1: accomplished.

Recommendation: no.

Standard 2: Educational programme

Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" according which students began to learn in the 2018-2019 academic year, is characterized by compliance with the SOES and a unique university component of choice provided by qualified teaching staff, integration of education and practice, flexible approach to the implementation of individual training and different methodological approaches to teaching. The programme content and the training conditions provided by

KazMUCE grounded the recruitment of students for all courses including internship. At the same time, recourses and methodological support of the basic medical disciplines need to be improved.

Strong points:

- High level of competence of university academic staff, ensuring the quality of preparation of Bachelor's degree students;
- Active cross-sectoral cooperation of the university with stakeholders while preparing "Pharmacy" educational programme;
- Introduction of innovative teaching methods into the educational process, according to the level of student's competence.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 25, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 2: accomplished.

Recommendations:

- *To strengthen the interconnection between research and education through the PDES and SRO and to develop mechanisms to encourage students to participate in research in the sphere of pharmacy;*
- *To consider the possibility of including a research methodology in the educational programme as a separate discipline.*

Standard 3: Assessment of students

The policy of students' achievements assessment, developed in KazMUCE, is characterized by objectivity and individual approach. Taking into account that it is the first academic year of Bachelor's degree programme implementation, continuous assessment and midterm examination was analyzed. Competent teachers are involved in the assessment of students. Students gave feedbacks to improve the assessment methods. However, the results of it are not fully analyzed and taken into account when developing recommendations for improvement.

There is a registrar office and a test center. An electronic system for recording students' achievements is at the implementation stage. At the same time, it is necessary to review the test control validation mechanisms.

Strong points:

- The University has developed a transparent assessment of student's educational achievements;
- Organized feedback from students.
- Training is conducted at production bases, chemists, which allow to fully master all sections of the educational programme

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 15, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 3: accomplished.

Recommendations:

- *To strengthen social and educational work with the wide involvement of students in the activities of student organizations;*

Standard 4: Students

According to the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" training is conducted at all Bachelor's degree courses, but there are only 16 students. The policy of student recruitment and selection is notable for its flexible and attractive conditions for applicants, including a passing grade, which is lower than in other medical universities, a vast network of clinics and research centers with which KazMUCE has signed contracts, as well as provision of a room in a dormitory. There is a student republic "Nur", at the same time not enough juniors are involved in its activities, an insufficient number of student organizations of interest, which is explained by the first year of the implementation of pre-graduate education.

Strong points:

- KazMUCE has all the necessary conditions and resources for personal development and education of students (dormitories with gyms, do-it-yourself clubs, student self-governance);
- Student-oriented education;
- The university has student support programmes (psychological support service), students with excellent academic achievements can get government grant for education, discounts and benefits on tuition, material support for orphans and students without parental care).

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 15, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 4: accomplished.

Recommendations: no.

Standard 5: Academic staff/Faculty

The Bachelor's degree programme is supported by a strong faculty whose average age is about 50 years and the proportion of degrees is more than 60% and categories - 100%. Personnel policy is based on the Labor Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the internal regulations of the university on attracting, selecting and retaining of teachers, including through material (bonuses, differential payment for labor, compensation for publications in journals with high impact factor, participation in international events) and non-material factors (trade union, career growth). High corporate culture and a healthy microclimate of the university are one of the strengths of the organization. Teachers are able to use modern teaching methods.

Strong points:

- University personnel policy for hiring and development of academic staff;
- A lot of work is being done on differential payment for labor, according to key performance indicators.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 12, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 5: accomplished.

Recommendations:

- To develop faculty and students academic mobility;

- *To strengthen the work on stimulating scientific and educational-methodical activities of academic staff (payment for an article in the Scopus and WoS databases, writing textbooks and teaching aids).*

Standard 6: Educational resources

The implementation of Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" is ensured by diverse and sustainable educational resources (classrooms, computer labs, information and communication resources, library, clinical fund, practice bases with early access to patients). The strategic plan of KazMUCE includes activities for the development of the classroom, computer and library funds, as currently there are not enough educational materials for a number of disciplines, including in the state and English languages. It is necessary to update the literature on clinical and pharmaceutical disciplines. The University has acquired 500 tablets for use in the educational process and to provide access to the Internet. At the same time, there is no information on cooperation with other universities of Kazakhstan in the sphere of implementation of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy".

During the visit, bases for pharmacist training were shown to the external experts. The university cooperates with all universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan and is working with universities of the near and far abroad.

Strong points:

- The University has sufficient material and technical base for training Bachelor's degree students in "Pharmacy";
- Both teachers and students have access to all educational resources to achieve their goals.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 19, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 6: accomplished.

Recommendations:

- *Update the library fund in the specialty of pharmacy with modern publications, including in the state language.*

Standard 7: Programme evaluation

The system of monitoring of the educational programme implementation includes documents developed by the university. This process is carried out and regulated by the Department of Higher Education and Departments, provides for getting feedback from stakeholders (students, teachers, representatives of practical public health), resource analysis (IT, library, classroom fund, the number and quality of teachers).

Strong points:

- Not only all structural units of the university, but also students and stakeholders participate in the evaluation of educational programmes.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 17, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 7: accomplished.

Recommendations:

- *Active use of the feedback system from students and teachers and its analysis for the development of the Bachelor's degree programme.*

Standard 8: Governance and administration

The university has a strong management system and quality management, which is supported by the effective functioning of the University Board, the introduction of an advisory and consultative educational management system, whose work complies with the regulatory and legal requirements of the country. The university academic leadership in the educational environment is strengthened by expanding of the education levels - from Bachelor's degree to additional education, with the intention to introduce VET programmes in the future, as well as recruitment in management and teaching of the best professionals in medical education and clinical practice. The university activities are aimed at the implementation of the mission and the drive to sustainable development as a competitive and promising educational organization with a full cycle of training of health professionals.

The principles of corporate management are in the process of implementation.

Strong points:

- The University has approved itself in the market of medical services for advance training and retraining of practical healthcare employees;
- Sustainable financial position.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 13, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 8: accomplished.

Recommendations:

- *To include in the consultative and advisory bodies (Scientific Council, Educational Programme Committees) representatives of practical pharmacy.*

Standard 9: Continuous renewal

KazMUCE has included all improvement measures in the Strategic Plan for the Development of the University until 2022. The organizational structure of the University is reviewed annually. The management conducts an annual analysis of the degree of achievement of the mission and goals of the university, the goals and plans of the units.

Strong points:

- Advanced training of academic staff according to the approved plan;
- Graduates can further enroll in Master's and PhD programmes.

EEC conclusions on the criteria: fulfilled - 14, partially fulfilled - 0, not fulfilled - 0.

Standard 9: accomplished.

Recommendations:







- *To encourage students to participate in research programmes with the release of the publication.*

Recommendations for the improvement of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy":

- 1) To continue to provide students with new modern educational material in the state, Russian and English languages (textbooks, study guides.) up to 5 years;
- 2) To introduce learning through research into the educational process;
- 3) To develop distance learning technologies for pharmacists;
- 4) To strengthen the work on the stimulation of scientific and educational-methodical activities of teachers.

Рекомендация Аккредитационному совету ЕЦА

Члены ВЭК пришли к единогласному мнению рекомендовать Аккредитационному совету аккредитовать образовательную программу по специальности 5В110300 «Фармация» (бакалавриат) АО «КазМУНО» сроком на 5 лет.

Председатель ВЭК	Ералиева Ляззат Тасбулатовна	
Члены ВЭК:		
Зарубежный эксперт	Григорян Артем Сергеевич	
Национальные академические эксперты	Салимгереева Багдат Жанабаевна	
	Ермуханова Людмила Сергеевна	
	Мырзагулова Асель Орынтаевна	
	Алдабергенова Тауржан Калибековна	
	Жакипбеков Кайрат Сапарханович	
Работодатель-эксперт	Айтжанова Айжан Адилевна	
Студенты-эксперты	Дошанова Роза Сериковна	
	Джангарашева Дария Ержановна	
Наблюдатель от ЕЦА	Сарсенбаева Сауле Сергазиевна	

Recommendation to the Accreditation Council of ECAQA

Members of EEC reached common ground to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit programme in “Pharmacy” (Bachelor’s degree) of KazMUCE for a period of 5 years.

EEC Chair	Eralieva Lyazzat Tasbulatovna	_____
EEC members:		
International expert	Grigoryan Artem Sergeevich	_____
National academic experts	Salimgereeva Bagdat Zhanabaevna	_____
	Ermukhanova Lyudmila Sergeevna	_____
	Myrzagulova Asel Oryntaevna	_____
	Aldabergenova Taurzhan Kalibekovna	_____
	Zhakypbekov Kayrat Saparkhanovich	_____
Employer-expert	Aytzhanova Ayzhan Adilovna	_____
Expert-student	Doschanova Roza Serikovna	_____
	Dzhangarasheva Dariya Erzhanovna	_____
ECAQA observer	Sarsenbayeva Saule Sergazievna	_____

Appendix 1.

Quality profile and criteria for the external evaluation of the Bachelor's degree programme in "Pharmacy" (integrated variant)

Standard No.	Accreditation standard	Evaluation		
		Fulfilled	Partially fulfilled	Not fulfilled
	Number of evaluation criteria			
1.	Mission and outcomes	11	0	0
2.	Educational programme	25	0	0
3.	Assessment of students	15	0	0
4.	Students	15	0	0
5.	Academic staff/Faculty	12	0	0
6.	Educational resources	19	0	0
7.	Programme evaluation	17	0	0
8.	Governance and administration	13	0	0
9.	Continuous renewal	14	0	0
	Total	141	0	0